



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	International Research Journal of Pure and Applied Chemistry
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012 IRJPAC 2600
Title of the Manuscript:	A comparative study on the use of Calcium Acetate Lactate, Calcium chloride and Acidic Ammonium Acetate- Ethylene Diaminetetra acetic acid (AAAc-EDTA) for the quantification of extractable, P, K and Mg from acidic soils.

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments																																																												
Paper is much improved, but work is still needed. English still needs tidying up; e.g. in abstract ‘used as a basis’ Spelll check!!!! ‘analysed for the K, P and Mg contents’ should read ‘analysed for K, P and Mg content’. Over use of ‘soil’, P, K or Mg is enough after the initial lines, no need to continuously use ‘soil P’ etc. Assistance of native English speaker would be helpful to tidy up grammar and usage etc. References missing in lines 33 – 51 in introduction, Bray, Olsen and Truog . Methods. Again, no need for ‘The collected soil samples’, ‘Samples’ is sufficient. Table 1 needs more consistency, ratio given for some methods, not for others , and ‘1 + 2.5’ for pH. No reference given for Total C. Line 139; refer to figure 1. Table 3. Not what I had intended. There is no need to quote R² and R values in the same table, just clarity on what is being quoted. Also, each column should show clearly what variables are being compared, e.g. AAAC-EDTA –v- CAL. I would also like to see the R² values for each of the sub-categories in table 5. Bring Table 4 back to line 179 to separate from Table 5. Table 5; Consistency of terms, ‘Mean’ instead of ‘Average’. General comments; English as above, and close attention to references, both listing and quoting where necessary.	Has been corrected accordingly and the `soil' has been deleted> The table has been moved to the proposed position. The R2 values are indicated under each category <table><tr><th></th><th></th><th colspan="3">pH</th></tr><tr><th></th><th></th><th>5-6</th><th>4-4.99</th><th>3-3.99</th></tr><tr><td>P</td><td>AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.</td><td>0.11</td><td>0.02</td><td>0.03</td></tr><tr><td>K</td><td>AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.</td><td>0.53</td><td>0.00</td><td>0.10</td></tr><tr><td>Mg</td><td>AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.</td><td>0.78</td><td>0.01</td><td>0.23</td></tr><tr><th></th><th></th><th colspan="3">Organic Carbon</th></tr><tr><th></th><th></th><th>4.6-8.5</th><th>3-4.6</th><th>0.5-2.9</th></tr><tr><td>P</td><td>AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.</td><td>0.82</td><td>0.17</td><td>0.011</td></tr><tr><td>K</td><td>AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.</td><td>0.67</td><td>0.74</td><td>0.002</td></tr><tr><td>Mg</td><td>AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.</td><td>0.77</td><td>0.73</td><td>0.062</td></tr><tr><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr><tr><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr></table> Some reasons for the variation in quantity of nutrient extracted by method have been advanced.			pH					5-6	4-4.99	3-3.99	P	AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.	0.11	0.02	0.03	K	AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.	0.53	0.00	0.10	Mg	AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.	0.78	0.01	0.23			Organic Carbon					4.6-8.5	3-4.6	0.5-2.9	P	AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.	0.82	0.17	0.011	K	AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.	0.67	0.74	0.002	Mg	AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.	0.77	0.73	0.062										
		pH																																																											
		5-6	4-4.99	3-3.99																																																									
P	AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.	0.11	0.02	0.03																																																									
K	AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.	0.53	0.00	0.10																																																									
Mg	AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.	0.78	0.01	0.23																																																									
		Organic Carbon																																																											
		4.6-8.5	3-4.6	0.5-2.9																																																									
P	AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.	0.82	0.17	0.011																																																									
K	AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.	0.67	0.74	0.002																																																									
Mg	AAAc-EDTA –v- CAL.	0.77	0.73	0.062																																																									